

ISBN NO : 978-605-05-1582-4

ESER ADI : THE PROTECTION OF BIOMETRIC DATA IN THE
ERA OF ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE
TECHNOLOGY IN EU LAW

YAZAR ADI : FURKAN DARENDELİ

YAYIM YILI : 2023

THE PROTECTION OF BIOMETRIC DATA IN THE ERA OF
ARTIFICIAL INTELLIGENCE TECHNOLOGY IN EU LAW



ÖDEMELİ İSTEME VE GENEL DAĞITIM

YETKİN Basım Yayım ve Dağıtım A.Ş.

Strasbourg Caddesi No: 31/A 06430 Sıhhiye / ANKARA

Tel : 0 (312) 231 42 34 (35) – 232 03 43 Faks: 229 87 85

Şube: Abide-i Hürriyet Cad. No: 158 34381 Şişli / İSTANBUL

Tel: 0 (212) 234 50 56 (57) Pbx Faks: 0 (212) 234 50 58

e-mail: yetkin@yetkin.com.tr <http://www.yetkin.com.tr>

Yayınevi Sertifika No: 47453

Yayın Kodu: ISBN 978-605-05-1582-4

© Yetkin Yayınları 2023

Dizgi: YETKİN Elektronik Yayımcılık Sistemleri

Baskı: YETKİN BASİMEVİ

Kâzım Karabekir Caddesi No: 95/7-8-10

Tel: 0 (312) 341 00 06 06060 ANKARA

Matbaa Sertifika No: 47452

Furkan DARENDELİ

**THE PROTECTION OF BIOMETRIC DATA
IN THE ERA OF ARTIFICIAL
INTELLIGENCE TECHNOLOGY
IN EU LAW**

Ankara 2023

BOOKS:

Aşıkoğlu, Ş. İ. (2018). “Avrupa Birliği Ve Türk Hukukunda Kişisel Verilerin Korunması Ve Büyük Veri”:. İstanbul: Oniki Levha Yayıncılık

Carey, P. (2018). *Data protection: a practical guide to UK and EU law*. Oxford University Press, Inc

Çetin S., (2021) *Gelişen Teknolojiler ve Hukuk II – Yapay Zeka: Yapay Zeka Stratejileri ve Hukuk*, Onikilevha Yayıncılık

Dunstone, T., & Yager, N. (2008). *Biometric system and data analysis: Design, evaluation, and data mining*. Springer Science & Business Media

Feyzioğlu, G. (2021) *Gelişen Teknolojiler ve Hukuk II – Dijitalleşen Dünyada Yapay Zeka*., Onikilevha Yayıncılık

Giakoumopoulos, C.- Buttarelli F.- O’Flaherty.M. (2018). *Handbook on European data protection law*: 2018 Edition. European Union Agency for Fundamental Rights and Council of Europe,

Gish, H. (2005). Elements of Speaker Verification. In: Wayman, J., Jain, A., Maltoni, D., Maio, D. (eds) *Biometric Systems*. Springer, London

Hallevy, G. (2013). *When robots kill artificial intelligence under criminal law*. UPNE

Kindt, E. J. (2016). *Privacy and data protection issues of biometric applications* (Vol. 1). Springer

Kop, M. (2021, September). *EU Artificial Intelligence Act*: The European Approach to AI. Stanford-Vienna Transatlantic Technology Law Forum, Transatlantic Antitrust and IPR Developments, Stanford University, Issue.

Kuner, C., Docksey, C., & Bygrave, L. (2020). *The EU General Data Protection Regulation: A Commentary*. Oxford University Press.

Küzeci, E. (2010). *Kişisel verilerin korunması*., Ankara: Turhan Kitabevi

Paslı, A., Kaya, A., Engin, B. İ., Aşıkoğlu, Ş. İ., & Oğuz, E. (2020). *Türk Hukukunun Avrupa Birliği Hukukuna Uyumu Özel Hukuk*. İstanbul University Press

Stone, P., Brooks, R., Brynjolfsson, E., Calo, R., Etzioni, O., Hager, G& Teller, A. (2016). Artificial intelligence and life in 2030: the one hundred year study on artificial intelligence. Stanford University

Zibran, M. F. (2009). Eye based authentication: Iris and retina recognition. Technical Report#2011-04, University of Saskatchewan.

Voigt, P., B., (2017) *The EU GDPR: A Practical Guide*, Springer, Heidelberg

ARTICLES:

Adjabi, I., Ouahabi, A., Benzaoui, A., & Taleb-Ahmed, A. (2020). "Past, present, and future of face recognition". A review. *Electronics*, 9(8), 1188., 1-52

Aliyev, A. I., Rzayeva, G. A., & Ibrahimova, A. N. (2021). "Artificial Intelligence and Personal Data: International and National Framework." *Peace Human Rights Governance*, 5(1). 97-123

Asha, S., & Chellappan, C. (2012). "Biometrics: an overview of the technology, issues and applications." *International Journal of Computer Applications*, 39(10), 35-52

BAK, B (2018). "Medeni Hukuk Açısından Yapay Zekânın Hukuki Statüsü ve Yapay Zekâ Kullanımından Doğan Hukuki Sorumluluk". *Türkiye Adalet Akademisi Dergisi*, (35), 211-232.

Barua, K., Bhattacharya, S., & Mali, K. (2011). "Fingerprint identification." *Global Journal of Computer Science and Technology*. Volume 11 Issue 6, (61-63)

Bartlow N. (2009) "Keystroke Recognition." In: Li S.Z., Jain A. (eds) *Encyclopedia of Biometrics*. Springer, Boston, MA.

Binns, R. (2019). "Human Judgment in algorithmic loops: Individual justice and automated decision-making". *Regulation & Governance*. P.1 Available At: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/full/10.1111/rego.12358>. Last Visited 01.04.2022

Bourcha, C., Deftou, M. L., & Koskina, A. (2017). "Data mining of biometric data: revisiting the concept of private life?". *Ius et Scientia*, 3 (2), (37-62).

Bozüyük, T., Yağci, C., Gökçe, İ., & Akar G. (2005). Yapay Zeka Teknolojilerinin Endüstrideki Uygulamaları., Available At: www.teknoloji.isparta.edu.tr/assets/uploads/sites/134/files/is-yeri-egitimi-6-hafta-odev-notu-08052020.pdf. Last Visited 25.10.2021

Busch, C., Nouak, A., Zhou, X., Suchier, J. M., Kelkboom, E., & Kevenaer, T. (2008). "3D Face Recognition for Unattended Border Control". *Security and Management*, 8, 350-356

Calo, R. (2017). "Artificial intelligence policy: a primer and roadmap." *UCDL Rev.*, 51, 399-475

Carpenter, D., McLeod, A., Hicks, C., (2018). *Privacy and biometrics: An empirical examination of employee concerns*. *Inf Syst Front* 20, (91–110) Available At: <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10796-016-9667-5>.

Christakis, T., Bannelier, K., Castelluccia, C., & Le Métayer, D. (2022). "Mapping the Use of Facial Recognition in Public Spaces in Europe—Part 1: A Quest for Clarity: Unpicking the 'Catch-All' Term". Available at SSRN 4110512

Colmenarez, A. J., & Huang, T. S. (1998). "Face detection and recognition. In *Face Recognition* " (Springer, Berlin, Heidelberg. pp. (174-185).

Dai, P., & Rudge, D. (2018). "Using the discovery of the structure of DNA to illustrate cultural aspects of science." *The American Biology Teacher*, 80(4), 256-262

Deb, S. (2003). "Multimedia Systems and Content-based Retrieval." In *Face Recognition Technology* (pp. 62-101)

Down, M. P., & Sands, R. J. (2004). "Biometrics: An overview of the technology, challenges and control considerations." *Information Systems Control Journal*, 4, 53-56

Dülger, M. V. (2019). "Protection of Personal Data in the Context of the European Union General Data Protection Regulation". *Yaşar Hukuk Dergisi*, 1(2), (71-174).

Dülger, M. V., Çetin, S., Aydın, C., (2021). "Algoritmik Karar Verme ve Veri Koruması (Algorithmic Decision Making and Data Protection)." Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=3792207>. Last Visited 03.04.2022

Ebelogu, C. & Amujo, O. & Adelaiye, O. & Silas, F. (2019). "Privacy Concerns in Biometrics", *IEEE-SEM*, Volume 10, Issue 7, July-2019 ISSN 2320-9151,(45-52),

Edward S., Jiahong C., (2021) What does it mean for a data subject to make their personal data 'manifestly public'? An analysis of GDPR Article

9(2)(e), *International Data Privacy Law*, Volume 11, Issue 2, Pages 107-124, <https://doi.org/10.1093/idpl/ipab005>

Hacker, P. (2018). "Teaching fairness to artificial intelligence: existing and novel strategies against algorithmic discrimination under EU law." *Common Market Law Review*, 55(4). Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=3164973>, 1143-1186.

Haenlein, M., & Kaplan, A. (2019). "A brief history of artificial intelligence: On the past, present, and future of artificial intelligence." *California management review*, 61(4), 5-14

Hill, R. (1996). "Retina identification. In *Biometrics*" (pp. 123-141). Springer, Boston, MA.

Kaushal, N., & Kaushal, P. (2011). "Human identification and fingerprints:" a review. *J Biomet Biostat*, 2(123), 2. DOI: 10.4172/2155-6180.1000123. P.1

Kok, J. N., Boers, E. J., Kusters, W. A., Van der Putten, P., & Poel, M. (2009). *Artificial intelligence: definition, trends, techniques, and cases*. EOLSS Publications

Koza, J. R., Bennett, F. H., Andre, D., & Keane, M. A. (1996). "Automated design of both the topology and sizing of analog electrical circuits using genetic programming. In *Artificial intelligence in design*", (pp. 151-170), Springer, Dordrecht

Maguire, M. (2009). "The birth of biometric security". *Anthropology today*, 25(2), 9-14

Marda, V., & Ahmed, S. (2021). *Emotional Entanglement: China's emotion recognition market and its implications for human rights*. Available At: <https://www.article19.org/emotion-recognition-technology-report/>. Last Visited 05.03.2022

Metin, Y. (2002). "Avrupa Birliği Temel Haklar Şartı. "Ankara Üniversitesi SBF Dergisi". 57(04). (35-53)

Penny K.H.(2021). "Iris Recognition Technology for Improved Authentication." *Sans Security Essentials (Gsec) Practical Assignment*, Version. 2021;3. Available At: <https://www.sans.org/white-papers/132/>. Last Visited 05.02.2022

Phadke, S. (2013). "The Importance of a Biometric Authentication System". *The SIJ Transactions on Computer Science Engineering & its Applications*, 1 (4), 128-132

Pi, Y. (2021). "Machine learning in Governments: Benefits, Challenges and Future Directions". *JeDEM-eJournal of eDemocracy and Open Government*, 13(1), 203-219.

Ploeg, I. V. D. (2012). "Security in the danger zone: Normative issues of next generation biometrics. In *Second generation biometrics: The ethical, legal and social context* "Springer, Dordrecht.(pp. 287-303).

Pruzansky, S. (1963). "Pattern-Matching Procedure for Automatic Talker Recognition." *The Journal of the Acoustical Society of America*, 35(3), 354-358.

Said, A. B., Erradi, A., Aly, H., & Mohamed, A. (2020). "A deep-learning model for evaluating and predicting the impact of lockdown policies on COVID-19 cases". *arXiv preprint arXiv:2009.05481*

Selçuk, E. (2014). "Lizbon Sonrası Avrupa Birliği'nin Yenilenen Temel Haklar Sorunsali." *Marmara Üniversitesi Avrupa Topluluğu Enstitüsü Avrupa Araştırmaları Dergisi*, 22(1), 121-147

Suvarnsing B., & Sangramsing K., N. & Raju M., & Jaypalsing K., & Charansing K.. (2015). "DNA Biometric"., *IOSR Journal of VLSI and Signal Processing (IOSR-JVSP)* Volume 5, Issue 5, Ver. I (Sep - Oct. 2015), PP 82-84, P.83

Taigman, Y., Yang, M., Ranzato, M. A., & Wolf, L. (2014). "Deepface: Closing the gap to human-level performance in face verification." In *Proceedings of the IEEE conference on computer vision and pattern recognition* (pp. 1701-1708).

Temir, E. (2020). Deepfake: new era in the age of disinformation & end of reliable journalism. *Selçuk İletişim*, 13(2), (1009-1024).

The University of Minnesota Human Rights Center, (2020)," Use of Biometric Data to Identify Terrorists: Best Practice or Risky Business?", P.2, Available At: <https://www.ohchr.org/Documents/Issues/Terrorism/Use-Biometric-Data-Summary.pdf>. Last Visited 20.02.2022

Trokielewicz, M., Czajka, A., & Maciejewicz, P. (2018). "Iris recognition in cases of eye pathology." *ArXiv*, abs/1809.01040.

Turing, A. M., & Haugeland, J. (1950). "Computing machinery and intelligence", Cambridge, MA: MIT Press. (pp. 29-56).

Turk, M., & Pentland, A. (1991)." Eigenfaces for recognition." *Journal of cognitive neuroscience*, 3(1), (71-86)

Waller, M., & Waller, P. (2020). "Why Predictive Algorithms are So Risky for Public Sector Bodies." Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=3716166> or <http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3716166>. Last Visited 27.03.2022

Wang, P. S., & Yanushkevich, S. N. (2007). "Biometric technologies and applications. In *Artificial Intelligence and Applications*" (pp. 249-254).

Wong, R. (2012). "The data protection directive 95/46/EC: idealisms and realisms. *International Review of Law*", *Computers & Technology*, 26(2-3), (229-244).

Wouters, N., Kelly, R., Velloso, E., Wolf, K., Ferdous, H. S., Newn, J., ... & Vetere, F. (2019, June). "Biometric mirror: Exploring ethical opinions towards facial analysis and automated decision-making." In *Proceedings of the 2019 on Designing Interactive Systems Conference* (pp. 447-461)

Yadav, A. K., & Tadisetty, S. (2012)." Iris based de-duplication technology." *IJERA*, 2(1), (164-167).

Yılmaz, İ., Sözer, C., & Elver, E. "Yapay Zeka İle İlgili Güncel Düzenlemeler: Avrupa Birliği Ve Amerika Birleşik Devletlerinde Alınan Aksiyonlar Işığında Bir Değerlendirme". *Adalet Dergisi*, (66), (445-469)

THESES

Çabuk, E., (2020), "Avrupa Birliği Düzenlemeleri Işığında Türk Hukukunda Kişisel Verilerin Korunması", Master Thesis Bahçesehir University Social Science Institute

Erdoğan, G.H, "Bilgi Güvenliği, Kişisel Verilerin Korunması Ve Biyometrik Verilerin İşlenmesine İlişkin Öneriler" Master Thesis Istanbul Technical University Informatics Institute

Gürses, B. (2019). "AB Ve Türk Hukukunda kişisel Verilerin korunması-Mevzuat Uyumuna yönelik Bir değerlendirme" "PHD Thesis, Marmara University.

Özkorul, G. (2021). "Uluslararası göç ve güvenlik perspektifinde biyometrik verilerin önemi" Master's thesis, Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü.

Tuncay, M., (2019), Biyometrik Verileri Korunması.", Master Thesis L.L.M Bahçesehir University Social Sciences Institute

REPORTS /GUIDELINES/ OPINIONS / RECOMMENDATIONS:

Article 29 data protection working party guidelines on automated individual decision-making and profiling for the purposes of regulation, 2016/679

Article 29 Data Protection Working Party, (2012) Opinion 3/2012 On Developments In Biometric Technologies

Article 29 Working Party (2014), "Opinion 06/2014 on the notion of legitimate interests of the data controller under Article 7 of Directive 95/46/EC

Busch, C., Nouak, A., Zhou, X., van der Veen, M., Deravi, F., & Suchier, J. M. (2007, September). Towards unattended and privacy protected border control. In 2007 Biometrics symposium

Castelluccia, C., & Le Métayer, D. (2019). Understanding algorithmic decision-making: Opportunities and challenges. European Parliament. P.II Available At: [https://www.europarl.europa.eu/thinktank/en/document.html?reference=EPRS_STU\(2019\)624261](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/thinktank/en/document.html?reference=EPRS_STU(2019)624261). Last Visited 01.04.2022

Codagnone, C., LIVA, G., & BALLELL, T. R. D. L. H. (2022). Identification and assessment of existing and draft EU legislation in the digital field. Study for the special committee on Artificial Intelligence in a Digital Age (AIDA), Policy Department for Economic, Scientific and Quality of Life Policies, European Parliament, Luxembourg. P.62

Dantcheva, A.; Chen, C.; Ross, A. Can facial cosmetics affect the matching accuracy of face recognition systems? In Proceedings of the 2012 IEEE Fifth International Conference on Biometrics: Theory, Applications and Systems (BTAS), Arlington, VA, USA, 23–27 September 2012

Dumortier, F. (2018). "PROTECT (Pervasive and User Focused Biometrics Border Project): D2. 2 Legal framework of biometric border control.", Available At: <https://researchportal.unamur.be/en/publications/protect-pervasive-and-user-focused-biometrics-border-project-d22-> Last Visited 25.04.2022

EDPB, EDPB-EDPS Joint Opinion 5/2021 on the proposal for a Regulation of the European Parliament and of the Council laying down harmonised rules on artificial intelligence (Artificial Intelligence Act),

European Commission, "Why do we need the Charter?" Available At: https://ec.europa.eu/info/aid-development-cooperation-fundamental-rights/your-rights-eu/eu-charter-fundamental-rights/why-do-we-need-charter_en. Last Visited 22.08.2022

European Commission,"The EU's accession to the European Convention on Human Rights: Joint statement on behalf of the Council of Europe and the European Commission", (2020), Available At: https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/STATEMENT_20_1748. Last Visited 22.08.2022

European Commission. (2020). *White Paper on Artificial Intelligence: A European approach to excellence and trust*,

European Council,"Protection and promotion of human rights", (2022), Available At <https://www.consilium.europa.eu/en/policies/human-rights/>. Last Visited 23.08.2022

European Data Protection Board, Guidelines 03/2020 on the processing of data concerning health for the purpose of scientific research in the context of the COVID-19 outbreak, Adopted on 21 April 2020, Available At: https://edpb.europa.eu/sites/edpb/files/files/file1/edpb_guidelines_202003_healthdatascientificresearchcovid19_en.pdf. Last Visited 19.03.2022

Fuster, G. G., & Peeters, M. A. N. (2021). *Person Identification, Human Rights and Ethical Principles: Rethinking Biometrics In The Era of Artificial Intelligence.*, Available At: [https://www.europarl.europa.eu/stoa/en/document/EPRS_STU\(2021\)697191](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/stoa/en/document/EPRS_STU(2021)697191). Last Visited : 02.03.2022

Giovanni Sartor; Francesca Lagioia, (2020), *The impact of the General Data Protection Regulation (GDPR) on artificial intelligence*,European Parliament, Available At:[https://www.europarl.europa.eu/thinktank/en/document.html?reference=EPRS_STU\(2020\)641530](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/thinktank/en/document.html?reference=EPRS_STU(2020)641530). Last Visited : 28.03.2022

Human Rights Council, (2021), *The right to privacy in the digital age** Report of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights Advance Edited Version

Madiega, T. & Mildebrath, H.(2021). *Regulating facial recognition in the EU. European Parliamentary Research Service*, Available At: [https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/IDAN/2021/698021/EPRS_IDA\(2021\)698021_EN.pdf](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/RegData/etudes/IDAN/2021/698021/EPRS_IDA(2021)698021_EN.pdf). Last Visited : 02.03.2022

Wendehorst, C., & Duller, Y. (2021). *Biometric Recognition and Behavioural Detection. Study Requested by the JURI and PETI Committees of the European Parliament*

WIPO, W. (2019). *Technology trends 2019: Artificial intelligence*. Geneva: World Intellectual Property Organization

LEGISLATIONS:

Annexes To The Proposal For A Regulation Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Laying Down Harmonised Rules On Artificial Intelligence (Artificial Intelligence Act) And Amending Certain Union Legislative Acts.

Charter of the United Nations

Council Regulation (EC) No 2252/2004

Common Position (EC) No 1/95 Adopted By The Council On 20 February 1995 With A View To Adopting Directive 95/. . /EC Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Of. On The Protection of Individuals With Regard To The Processing Of Personal Data And On The Free Movement Of Such Data (95/C 93/01, The Council Of The European Communities. Official Journal L, No C 93/1

Directive 95/46/EC

European Convention on Human Rights General Data Protection Regulation

Law enforcement Directive

Proposal For A Regulation Of The European Parliament And Of The Council Laying Down Harmonised Rules On Artificial Intelligence (Artificial Intelligence Act) And Amending Certain Union Legislative Acts

Regulation 1987/2006

Treaty on European Union

United Nations Security Council Resolution (2014). 2160.

CASES:

C-61/22 - Landeshauptstadt Wiesbaden, Summary

C-291/12 Schwarz v Stadt Bochum , (2013)

C-524/06, Heinz Huber v. Bundesrepublik Deutschland [GC],

Joined cases C-446/12 to C-449/12 Willems et al. v Burgemeester van Den Haag, (2015

Case Of Peck V. The United Kingdom, (2003), (Application No. 44647/98)

Gaughran V. The United Kingdom, (2020), (Application No. 45245/15)

Malone v Metropolitan Police Commissioner [1984] (Application no. 8691/79)

Leander V. Sweden, (1987), (Application No. 9248/81)

M.K. V. France (2013), (Application no. 19522/09)

Peck v. the United Kingdom, (2003), (Application no. 44647/98).

Rotaru V. Romania, (2000),(Application no. 28341/95)

S. and Marper v. the United Kingdom (2008),

NEWS:

BBC, (21.08.2019), "Biostar 2: Suprema plays down fingerprint leak reports", Available At: [https:// www. bbc.com/news/technology-49418931](https://www.bbc.com/news/technology-49418931)
Last Visited : 02.04.2022

Bloomberg Intelligence,(2017), "Business-focus on artificial intelligence rising", Available At: [https:// www. bloomberg.com/professional/blog/business-focus-artificial-intelligence-rising-2/](https://www.bloomberg.com/professional/blog/business-focus-artificial-intelligence-rising-2/). Last Visited : 11.10.2021

FT, (2021), *Emotion recognition: can AI detect human feelings from a face?*, Available At: [https:// www. ft. com/content/c0b03d1d-f72f-48a8-b342-b4a926109452](https://www.ft.com/content/c0b03d1d-f72f-48a8-b342-b4a926109452). Last Visited :06.03.2022

www.forbes.com/sites/bernardmarr/2018/11/19/is-artificial-intelligence-dangerous-6-ai-risks-everyone-should-know-about/?sh=1aec3a572404

WEBSITES / INTERNET BLOG

Access Now, European Digital Rights (EDRi), Bits of Freedom, ARTICLE19 , IT-Pol, (2021), Prohibit remote biometric categorisation in publicly accessible spaces, and any discriminatory biometric categorization, Available At <https://www.accessnow.org/AIAct-biometric-categorisation>. Last Visited 23.08.2022 P.1-2

AI Now, (n.d), *Automated Decision Systems Examples Of Government Use Cases Issue*: Last Visited .25.03.2022 Available At: <https://ainowinstitute.org/nycadschart.pdf>

Albayrak, B. (n.d.). "Parmak izi sistemi nedir? Nasıl çalışır? Nereelerde kullanılır?", Available At: [https:// www.moonwell.com.tr/parmak-izi-sistemi-nedir-nasil-calisir-nerelerde-kullanilir/](https://www.moonwell.com.tr/parmak-izi-sistemi-nedir-nasil-calisir-nerelerde-kullanilir/). Last Visited : January 15, 2022,

Arslan, Z., (2019), "Yapay Zeka Ve Over The Top Hizmetler Aracılığıyla Profilleme", Available At: <https://www.rskveri.com/yapay-zeka-ve-over-the-top-hizmetler-araciligiyla-profilleme/>. Last Visited :05.04.2022,

Balaji, P. (2010). "An Overview-DNA as a Biometric Data Identifier." Available at SSRN: <https://ssrn.com/abstract=1572236> or <http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.1572236>. Last Visited : 15.02.2022

Bateman, R., (2022), GDPR Lawful Basis: Legal Obligation, Available At: <https://www.termsfeed.com/blog/gdpr-lawful-basis-legal-obligation/>. Last Visited : 27.02.2022

Belkadi, L., (2020), "The Proposed Artificial Intelligence Act and Biometric Systems: A Peek Into the Conceptual Maze (Part I)", Available At: www.law.kuleuven.be/citip/blog/the-proposed-artificial-intelligence-act-and-biometric-systems-part-i/. Last Visited : 24.03.2022

Benjamin Kuipers, "Progress in AI" (2019, Available At: <https://web.eecs.umich.edu/~kuipers/opinions/AI-progress.html>. Last Visited 30.08.2022

BioConnect. (2021, December 8). "A Brief History of Biometrics.", Available At: <https://bioconnect.com/2021/12/08/a-brief-history-of-biometrics/>. Last Visited 03.01.2022

Blanca, E.,(2021), "ey-woman-wearing-augmented-reality-glasses-touching-screen Biometric systems in the forthcoming EU Artificial Intelligence Act", Available At: https://www.ey.com/en_es/law/biometric-systems-in-the-forthcoming-eu-artificial-intelligence. Last Visited : 11.03.2022

Bosso, J., (2021), "The dangers of government use of biometric data", Available At: <https://blog.avast.com/government-use-of-biometric-data-avast>. Last Visited : 25.03.2022

CAHAI - Ad hoc Committee on Artificial Intelligence ,(2020), *Towards regulation of AI systems (2020* Available At: <https://edoc.coe.int/en/artificial-intelligence/9656-towards-regulation-of-ai-systems.html>). Last Visited: 06.12.2021

Circiumaru, A. (2021), "Three proposals to strengthen the EU Artificial Intelligence Act", Available At: www.adalovelaceinstitute.org/blog/three-proposals-strengthen-eu-artificial-intelligence-act/. Last Visited : 28.03.2022

Clifford, C. (2018, February 1). "Google CEO: A.I. is more important than fire or electricity.", Available At:

<https://www.cnn.com/2018/02/01/google-ceo-sundar-pichai-ai-is-more-important-than-fire-electricity.html>. Last Visited : 18.11.2021

Coalition of civil society organisations, (2021), Coalition of civil society organisations, Available At: [https:// algorithmwatch.org/en/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/Civil-society-reacts-to-EP-AI-Act-draft-report.pdf](https://algorithmwatch.org/en/wp-content/uploads/2022/05/Civil-society-reacts-to-EP-AI-Act-draft-report.pdf). Last Visited 24.08.2022

Darama, S, “Yapay Zekanin Hukuki Statüsü Hakkındaki Görüşler Üzerine Değerlendirme”, (2021), Available At: <https://www.ozgunlaw.com/makaleler/yapay-zekanin-hukuki-statusu-hakkındaki-gorusler-uzerine-degerlendirme-744>. Last Visited 19.02.2023

Data Protection Commission, (n.d), "Law Enforcement Directive, Available At: [https://www. dataprotection.ie/ en/organisations/resources-organisations/law-enforcement-directive](https://www.dataprotection.ie/en/organisations/resources-organisations/law-enforcement-directive). Last Visited : 08.04.2022

Del Gamba, G. (2020, May 13). “Machine learning, risks and benefits of automated decisions”. Available At: <https://www.insuranceup.it/en/opinions/machine-learning-risks-and-benefits-of-automated-decisions/>. Last Visited 25.01.2022

Dezhic,E, "Artificial vs Natural Intelligence", (2017), Available At: <https://becominghuman.ai/artificial-vs-natural-intelligence-82ccd056b212> , Last Visited 22.08.2022

ECHR, (n.d.) *European court of human rights & question and answers*, Available At: [https:// www.echr.coe.int/documents/questions_answers_eng.pdf](https://www.echr.coe.int/documents/questions_answers_eng.pdf). Last Visited :12.03.2022

EDPB, (2021)," EDPB & EDPS call for ban on use of AI for automated recognition of human features in publicly accessible spaces, and some other uses of AI that can lead to unfair discrimination", Available At: https://edpb.europa.eu/news/news/2021/edpb-edps-call-ban-use-ai-automated-recognition-human-features-publicly-accessible_en. Last Visited : 24.03.2022

Edri, (2018), “Smart Borders: the challenges remain a year after its adoption”, Available At: <https://edri.org/our-work/smart-borders-the-challenges-remain-a-year-after-its-adoption/>. Last Visited : 20.04.2022

EDRİ, (2022) “ ID-Fingerprint obligation to be reviewed by European Court of Justice”, Available At: <https://edri.org/our-work/id-fingerprint-obligation-to-be-reviewed-by-european-court-of-justice/>. Last Visited : 04.05.2022

ETIAS, (2022), The Schengen Information System: Keeping Europe Safe, Available At: [https:// www.etiasvisa. com/etias-news/schengen-information-system-sis](https://www.etiasvisa.com/etias-news/schengen-information-system-sis). Last Visited : 15.04.2022

European Commission, (2022), EUROCAD "(European Asylum Dactloscopy Database)", Available At: [https:// knowledge4policy. ec.europa.eu/dataset/ds00008_en](https://knowledge4policy.ec.europa.eu/dataset/ds00008_en). Last Visited :20.04.2022

European Commission, "Entry/Exit System (EES)", Available At: https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/policies/schengen-borders-and-visa/smart-borders/entry-exit-system_en. Last Visited : 20.04.2022

European Commission, (2019), "Ethics guidelines for trustworthy AI", Available At: [https://digital-strategy. ec.europa.eu/en/library/ethics-guidelines-trustworthy-ai](https://digital-strategy.ec.europa.eu/en/library/ethics-guidelines-trustworthy-ai). Last Visited : 02.12.2021

European Commission, (n.d), "The European AI Alliance", Available At: [https://digital-strategy. ec.europa. eu/en/policies/european-ai-alliance](https://digital-strategy.ec.europa.eu/en/policies/european-ai-alliance). Last Visited : 03.12.2021

European Commission,, "Visa Information System (VIS)", Available At: https://ec.europa.eu/home-affairs/policies/schengen-borders-and-visa/visa-information-system_en. Last Visited . 18.04.2022

European Court of Human Rights, (2021), "Guide on Article 8 of the European Convention on Human Rights", Available At: https://www.echr.coe.int/documents/guide_art_8_eng.pdf. Last Visited : 22.02.2022

European Parliament, (2019), *Motion For A European Parliament Resolution*, Available At: [https://www.europarl. europa.eu/doceo/ document/A-8-2019-0019_EN.html](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/doceo/document/A-8-2019-0019_EN.html). Last Visited : 25.11.2021

European parliament, (2021) "Completion Of Eu Accession To The European Convention On Human Rights", Available At: <https://www.europarl.europa.eu/legislative-train/theme-area-of-justice-and-fundamental-rights/file-completion-of-eu->. Last Visited : 27.02.2022

European Parliament. (2020, September 4). "What is artificial intelligence and how is it used?" ,Available At:[www.europarl. europa.eu/news/en/headlines/society/ 20200827STO85804/what-is-artificial-intelligence-and-how-is-it-used](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/news/en/headlines/society/20200827STO85804/what-is-artificial-intelligence-and-how-is-it-used). AccessDate,10.10.2021

European Parliament, "European Parliament resolution of 20 October 2020 with recommendations to the Commission on a civil liability regime for artificial intelligence", (2020), Available At: [https://www. europarl.](https://www.europarl.europa.eu/legislative-train/theme-area-of-justice-and-fundamental-rights/file-completion-of-eu-)

europa.eu/doceo/document/TA-9-2020-0276_EN.html. Last Visited 21.02.2023

Gibson, A., Tessa, M., (2020), "Artificial Intelligence In The Public Sector – Inference And Collection", Available At:<https://ovic.vic.gov.au/blog/artificial-intelligence-in-the-public-sector-inference-and-collection/>. Last Visited :19.03.2022

Global ID Summit, (2018), "Identity in a Digital Age:A Glance At The Countries Leading the Revolution,", Available At: <https://www.idga.org/events-globalidsummit/downloads/sponsorship-information-mt>. Last Visited : 23.03.2022

Gonzalez, G., (2021), "Person identification, human rights and ethical principles: Rethinking biometrics in the era of artificial intelligence", Available At: <https://free-group.eu/2021/12/17/person-identification-human-rights-and-ethical-principles-rethinking-biometrics-in-the-era-of-artificial-intelligence/>. Last Visited : 26.03.2022

Harris, T. (2020, August 3). How Fingerprint Scanners Work., Available At: <https://computer.howstuffworks.com/fingerprint-scanner.htm> Last Visited : 15.01.2022

Herrera ,P., (2013), "Estrella Gutiérrez: ECJ Judgment Schwarz (C-291/12) Biometric data and respect for private life Access" Date:18.03.2022 Available At: <https://ecjleadingcases.wordpress.com/category/datos-biometricos-biometric-data/>

Hewage, Chaminda. (2019). "Stolen Fingerprints Could Spell The End Of Biometric Security", Available At: <https://theconversation.com/stolen-fingerprints-could-spell-the-end-of-biometric-security-heres-how-to-save-it-122001>. Last Visited :02.04.2022

Hidvegi, F., Leufer, D., Masse., Estelle, (2021), "The EU should regulate AI on the basis of rights, not risks", Available At: <https://www.accessnow.org/eu-regulation-ai-risk-based-approach/>. Last Visited : 08.03.2022

HRB, (n.d), "Special category personal data", Available At: <https://www.hrb.ie/funding/gdpr-guidance-for-researchers/gdpr-overview/special-category-personal-data/>. Last Visited :15.03.2022

ICO, (n.d), " What are the conditions for processing?", Available At. <https://ico.org.uk/for-organisations/guide-to-data-protection/guide-to-the-general-data-protection-regulation-gdpr/special-category-data/what-are-the-conditions-for-processing/>. Last Visited .10.03.2022

ICO, "What is automated individual decision-making and profiling?", (n.d), Available At <https://ico.org.uk/for-organisations/guide-to-data-protection/guide-to-the-general-data-protection-regulation-gdpr/automated-decision-making-and-profiling/what-is-automated-individual-decision-making-and-profiling/>. Last Visited 23.08.2022

Ivan Klekovic, "EU GDPR vs. European data protection directive", (2017), Available At <https://advisera.com/eugdpracademy/blog/2017/10/30/eu-gdpr-vs-european-data-protection-directive/>. Last Visited 30.08.2022

Jakubowska, E. (2021, November 4). "Facebook deleting facial recognition: Five reasons to take it with a pinch of salt.", Available At: <https://reclaimyourface.eu/facebook-deleting-facial-recognition-five-reasons-to-take-it-with-a-pinch-of-salt/>. Last Visited : 07.01.2022

Jrc Science Hub Community, (2018), *EU Declaration on Cooperation on Artificial Intelligence*, Available At: <https://ec.europa.eu/jrc/communities/en/node/1286/document/eu-declaration-cooperation-artificial-intelligence>

Julia Angwin, Jeff Larson, Surya Mattu and Lauren Kirchner, ProPublica, " Machine Bias", (2016), Available At: <https://www.propublica.org/article/machine-bias-risk-assessments-in-criminal-sentencing>. Last Visited 30.08.2022

Justice.org.uk, *Protection of Freedoms Bill*, Available At: <https://justice.org.uk/protection-of-freedoms-bill/>. Last Visited : 13.03.2022

Karla Lant, "Confirmed: Ai Can Predict Heart Attacks And Strokes More Accurately Than Doctors", (2017), Available At: <https://futurism.com/neoscope/confirmed-ai-can-predict-heart-attacks-and-strokes-more-accurately-than-doctors> . Last Visited 30.08.2022

Kaya F , "Yapay Zeka Ve Yapay Zekanin Hukuki Kişiliği Meselesi", (2021), Available At: <http://blog.ilem.org.tr/yapay-zeka-ve-yapay-zekanin-hukuki-kisiligi-meselesi>. Last Visited 21.02.2023

King, R. (2018, March 12). Explainer: "Keystroke recognition.", Available At: <https://www.biometricupdate.com/201612/explainer-keystroke-recognition>. Last Visited : 16.02.2022

Krasnokutsky, E., (2021), " AI Biometric Authentication for Enterprise Security". Available At: <https://mobidev.biz/blog/ai-biometrics-technology-authentication-verification-security>. Last Visited 30.08.2022

Loi, m. in collaboration with Mätzener A., Müller A., and Spielkamp M., (2021), “Automated Decision-Making Systems in the Public Sector – An Impact Assessment Tool for Public Authorities”, Available At: <https://algorithmwatch.org/en/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/ADMS-in-the-Public-Sector-Impact-Assessment-Tool-AlgorithmWatch-June-2021.pdf>. Last Visited : 26.03.2022

Marda, V., & Ahmed, S. , “Emotional Entanglement: China’s emotion recognition market and its implications for human rights.” (2022), Available At: <https://www.article19.org/emotion-recognition-technology-report>. Last Visited 23.08.2022

Mazzini, G., (2021), “A European Strategy for Artificial Intelligence” , ELI webinar ‘Regulating AI: A First Analysis of the European Commission’s Proposal’ 29 April 2021 Available At: https://www.europeanlawinstitute.eu/fileadmin/user_upload/p_eli/News_page/2021/Presentation_Gabriele_Mazzini.pdf. Last Visited :20.04.2022

Medium.com. (2018, March 16). “Yapay Zekanın Tarihçesi ve Gelişim Süreci.”, Available At: [medium. com/türkiye/yapay-zekanın-tarihçesi-ve-gelişim-süreci-cb4c73deb01d](https://medium.com/türkiye/yapay-zekanın-tarihçesi-ve-gelişim-süreci-cb4c73deb01d). Last Visited : 5.11.2021

Mesai N, (2021), “Can the criminal justice system’s artificial intelligence ever be truly fair?”, Available At: <https://massivesci.com/articles/machine-learning-compas-racism-policing-fairness/>. Last Visited :20.03.2022

Mitek systems, (2019), "Looking ahead: 7 reasons why biometric security is important for digital identity", Available At: <https://www.miteksystems.com/blog/looking-ahead-7-reasons-why-biometric-security-is-important-for-digital-identity>. Last Visited : 21.03.2022

Ng, A., (2020), "Clearview AI's entire client list stolen in data breach", Available At: [https:// www.cnet. com/news/privacy/clearview-ai-had-entire-client-list-stolen-in-data-breach/](https://www.cnet.com/news/privacy/clearview-ai-had-entire-client-list-stolen-in-data-breach/). Last Visited : 23.03.2022

Nordi N., (2018), “What is the Data Protection Directive? The Predecessor to the GDPR”, Available At: [https:// digitalguardian. com/blog/what-data-protection-directive-predecessor-gdpr](https://digitalguardian.com/blog/what-data-protection-directive-predecessor-gdpr). Last Visited : 08.04.2022

OECD, (2021), *Artificial Intelligence, Machine Learning and Big Data in Finance: Opportunities, Challenges, and Implications for Policy Makers*, Available At: <https://www.oecd.org/finance/financial-markets/Artificial-intelligence-machine-learning-big-data-in-finance.pdf>, Last Visited : 21.11.2021

Ombudsmanky, Fifth Data Protection Principle - Storage limitation, p.2 Available At: [https:// ombudsman.ky/images/pdf/guide/56-fifth-data-protection-principle-storage-limitation.pdf](https://ombudsman.ky/images/pdf/guide/56-fifth-data-protection-principle-storage-limitation.pdf). Last Visited 23.08.2022,

Ozbek Attorney Partnership, "Turkey: How To Increase Awareness About Personal Data Protection With Employees And Data Processors?",(2022) Available At [https://www.mondaq.com/turkey/data-protection/1162058/ how-to-increase-awareness-about-personal-data-protection-with-employees-and-data-processors](https://www.mondaq.com/turkey/data-protection/1162058/how-to-increase-awareness-about-personal-data-protection-with-employees-and-data-processors): . Last Visited 24.08.2022

Pew Research Center. (2018). "Public attitudes toward computer algorithms,USA, Access Data" 25.03.2022 Available At: [http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0308-5961\(20\)30068-9/sref45](http://refhub.elsevier.com/S0308-5961(20)30068-9/sref45)

Privacy International, (n.d), " what is privacy" , Available At: [https://privacyinternational.org/explainer/56/ what-privacy](https://privacyinternational.org/explainer/56/what-privacy). Last Visited : 03.04.2022

Rechtsanwälte, L., (2020),Regulation of Artificial Intelligence in Europe - What's in the pipeline?, Available At: <https://www.lexology.com/library/detail.aspx?g=d9f74ab9-139c-49e1-9d82-70de718af80f>. Last Visited : 04.12.2021

Rockcontentwriter," Artificial Intelligence Algorithm: Everything You Need To Know About It "(2021), Available at: <https://rockcontent.com/blog/artificial-intelligence-algorithm/%20efficiently>, Last Visited (22.08.2022)

Ross, D. (2017, December 31). "Processing biometric data? Be careful, under the GDPR.", Available At: <https://iapp.org/news/a/processing-biometric-data-be-careful-under-the-GDPR>. Last Visited : 27.12.2021

Seecurity, "The main differences between the DPD and the GDPR and how to address those moving forward", (2017), Available At: <https://britishlegalitforum.com/wp-content/uploads/2017/02/GDPR-Whitepaper-British-Legal-Technology-Forum-2017-Sponsor.pdf>. Last Visited 26.07.2022

Signalsvc.com, (2021), "Role of Artificial Intelligence and Machine Learning in Speech Recognition", Available At: [https:// signalscv.com/2021/07/role-of-artificial-intelligence-and-machine-learning-in-speech-recognition/](https://signalscv.com/2021/07/role-of-artificial-intelligence-and-machine-learning-in-speech-recognition/). Last Visited : 10.10.2021

Simonart, V, "Artificial Intelligence And Legal Personal", Available At: [https://liedekerke.com/en/ insights/ artificial-intelligence-and-legal-personality](https://liedekerke.com/en/insights/artificial-intelligence-and-legal-personality). Last Visited 21.02.2023

Stachyra, K., (2015), "ECJ: no legal basis for biometric data in ID cards", Available At: <https://europensblog.wordpress.com/tag/joined-cases-c-44612-to-c-44912/>. Last Visited .19.03.2022

Stanford University, (2021), *CHAPTER 7: AI Policy and National Strategies* , Available At: <https://aiindex.stanford.edu/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/2021-AI-Index-Report-Chapter-7.pdf>. Last Visited : 22.11.2021

Symanovich, S., (n.d)., " Biometric data breach: Database exposes fingerprints, facial recognition data of 1 million people", Available At: <https://us.norton.com/internetsecurity-emerging-threats-biometric-data-breach-database-exposes-fingerprints-and-facial-recognition-data.html>. Last Visited : 01.04.2022

Tandoğan,Z: (2019), “ Yapay Zekanın Geleceği, , Available At: <https://kantin.sabanciuniv.edu/sites/kantin.sabanciuniv.edu/files/makale/yapay-zekanin-gelecegi.pdf>. Last Visited : 01.11.2021

Tanya Lewis, A Brief History of Artificial Intelligence, (2014), Available At: <https://www.livescience.com/49007-history-of-artificial-intelligence.html> . Last Visited 30.08.2022

Thakkar , D., (2020), "Importance of Biometric Fingerprinting Technology: Does Your Organization Really Need It? This Will Help You Decide!" Available At: <https://www.bayometric.com/importance-of-biometric-fingerprinting-technology/> Last Visited . 20.03.2022

Thales. (2021, June 16). “Biometric data and privacy laws (GDPR, CCPA/CPRA).”, Available At: [thalesgroup.com/en/markets/digital-identity-and-security/government/biometrics/biometric-data](https://www.thalesgroup.com/en/markets/digital-identity-and-security/government/biometrics/biometric-data). Last Visited : 07.01.2022

Thomas, M. (2021, January 21). “The Future of AI: How Artificial Intelligence Will Change the World.”, Available At: <https://builtin.com/artificial-intelligence/artificial-intelligence-future>. Last Visited : 18.11.2021

United Nations,(n.d). “CTED publishes Analytical Brief on the use of biometrics in counter-terrorism“, Available At: <https://www.un.org/securitycouncil/ctc/news/cted-publishes-analytical-brief-use-biometrics-counter-terrorism>. Last Visited : 18.02.2022

Urban, T. (2015, June 22). “The AI Revolution: The Road to Superintelligence.” , Available At: <https://waitbutwhy.com/2015/01/artificial-intelligence-revolution-1.html> Last Visited : 08.11.2021.

Valerie Rivera, "What the Future of Data Protection Means for Your Business", (january 5 2022), Available At: https://www.insight.com/en_US/content-and-resources/2022/the-future-of-data-protection.html. Last Visited 22.08.2022

Veridiumid, "Biometric Identification or Biometric Authentication?" (2018, June 11), Available At: <https://www.veridiumid.com/biometric-identification-and-biometric-authentication>. Last Visited 08.01.2022

Witte, j. (2022), "Fingerprint obligation to be reviewed by European Court of Justice", Available At: <https://digitalcourage.de/blog/2022/fingerprint-obligation-to-be-reviewed-by-ecj>. Last Visited : 20.03.2022,

Zapproved, (2019), "Importance of Biometric Data Privacy", Available At: <https://zapproved.com/blog/just-how-important-is-it-to-protect-the-privacy-of-biometric-data/>. Last Visited :30.08.2022